



SHARING THE HARVEST

Creating a gender-equitable coffee supply chain in Papua New Guinea

Coffee Industry Support Project

End-of-Project Evaluation Phase 1 Report

DECEMBER 2020

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thank you to CARE International in Papua New Guinea management and staff for their time, patience and honesty in sharing their opinions, challenges and successes with the Coffee Industry Support Project (CISP), funded by the Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) under the Pacific Women Shaping Pacific Development (Pacific Women) program.

Special thanks to Doreen Fernando (Program Director – Mainland), Elsie Mongoru (Women's Economic Empowerment Program Manager), Eva Inamuka (Program Quality Manager) and Garry Matthews (Coffee Industry Project - Project Officer) for providing program oversight, technical insights and valuable feedback during this first phase of the evaluation.

We look forward to working with you on the second phase of the evaluation.

AUTHOR

Josie Huxtable

Independent consultant – Gender Equality and Social Inclusion

josie.huxtable@gmail.com



ACRONYMS

AAAK	Apo Angra Angna Kange
ACIAR	Australian Centre for International Agricultural Research
ANU	Australian National University
BECOMES	Bougainville Cocoa Families Support Project
CARE PNG	CARE International in PNG
CIC	Coffee Industry Corporation
CISP	Coffee Industry Support Project
DFAT	Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
EHP	Eastern Highlands Province
EOPO	End of Project Outcome
FBMT	Family Business Management Training
FLT	Financial Literacy Training
FST	Facilitation Skills Training
GAP	Gender Action Plans
GBV	Gender Based Violence
GED	Gender Equity and Diversity Training
GEF	Gender Equality Framework
GESI	Gender Equity and Social Inclusion
LUCDF	Lower Unggai Community Development Foundation
MTDP III	PNG Government Medium Term Development Plan III 2018-2022
MDF	Market Development Facility
MEL	Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning
MFF	Model Farming Families
NGHCE	New Guinea Highlands Coffee Exports
OGA	Organisational Gender Assessments
OST	Organisational Strengthening Training
Pacific Women	Pacific Women Shaping Pacific Development
PNG	Papua New Guinea
PNGCE	PNG Coffee Exports
PWD	People Living with a Disability
RFA	Rainforest Alliance
SCC	Sukapass Coffee Cooperative
SME	Small Medium Enterprises
SMS-PNG	Sustainable Management Services PNG
TOT	Training of Trainers
UC	University of Canberra
VSLA+	Village Savings Loans Association Plus

CONTENTS

1.0 INTRODUCTION	5
1.1 Context	5
1.2 Coffee Industry Support Project	6
2.0 METHODOLOGY	7
2.1 Scope and purpose	7
2.2 Methodology	7
2.3 Limitations.....	11
3.0 FINDINGS.....	12
3.1 Relevance	12
3.2 Effectiveness.....	14
3.3 Governance.....	32
3.4 Sustainability	34
3.5 Impact	36
PHASE 2 APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY	37

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Context

Coffee is a major export commodity for Papua New Guinea (PNG) earning around PGK 460 million per year and is an essential cash crop, with one-third of the population involved in its production, processing and sale. Coffee production is the backbone of the rural economy in the Highlands, with five provinces: Eastern Highlands (EHP), Western Highlands (WHP), Jiwaka, Morobe and Simbu provinces, accounting for over 90% of production. Production is dominated by coffee smallholder farmers and their families, who produce 85% of the annual crop. It is estimated that there are some 400,000 rural households in PNG that depend upon coffee to provide all or part of their income and about 70% of those live in rural areas. Approximately 60% of the income from coffee production goes directly to the growers.¹ Yet many areas where coffee is produced are disadvantaged, largely subsistence-dependent, rural areas characterized by lack of access to markets, services and income-generating opportunities. Agricultural support services and banking services are almost non-existent for the majority of smallholder farmers in these areas. Productivity remains low, with coffee yields averaging 30-50 per cent of their potential.² Coffee quality has declined over the last decade due to ageing plants, poor coffee husbandry practices, limited support services, and poor access to markets.³

Women make up a substantial part of coffee farming communities in the Highlands, provide significant labour and are directly engaged at critical stages of coffee production and processing: picking cherry, pulping, fermenting and drying. These are time-critical tasks and have significant bearing on the quality of the coffee delivered to the exporter. Despite serving as a critical component of the coffee production ecosystem, wide disparities persist between men and women, and women farmers, who are unpaid and unrecognised for their role in production, continue to be deprived of the benefits that should accrue to them. Women farmers have limited access to inputs, resources, training and credit as well as limited decision-making at the household and market levels. For example, in 2015 less than 10 percent of women farmers had access to extension services,⁴ and only five percent of the farmers who received extension training were women.⁵ Social norms are a main driver of inequality within the coffee supply chain, particularly social norms that limit women's productivity, access to and role in local markets and, thus, their ability to produce and generate income from sales of cocoa. Women work extensively on family farms where social norms dictate the role of men and women. For example, women are heavily involved in harvest and post-harvest activities, but are constrained from both access to and role in working with the local markets. Men typically take the final product to the market, negotiate prices, and ultimately control the profit from the sale of the product. This creates major power asymmetry between men and women, as women are effectively excluded from price negotiations, supply and delivery schedules, or in knowing market demand and supply attributes.

¹ Coffee Industry Corporation, 2008. *Papua New Guinea Coffee Industry Strategic Plan 2008-2018*. [http://www.cic.org.pg/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/images_pdfdownload_downloads_previousyears_StrategicPlan.pdf]

² World Bank. 2014. *The fruit of her labour. Promoting gender-equitable agribusiness in Papua New Guinea*.

³ CARE International in PNG. 2015. *Coffee Industry Support Project Design Document*. Unpublished.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Coffee Industry Support Project Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning Framework. Unpublished.

1.2 Coffee Industry Support Project

CARE International in PNG's (CARE PNG) Coffee Industry Support Project (CISP) has been funded by the Australian Government's Pacific Women Shaping Pacific Development (Pacific Women) program since July 2013. The project has had two key phases: phase one from July 2013 to June 2015; and phase two from July 2015 to June 2019.

The third and current phase is from July 2019- June 2022. The project has been implemented in Eastern Highlands province where the CARE PNG country office is located, Simbu Province, Western Highlands Province and Morobe Province.

Goal

The overall goal of CISP is to improve the economic and social wellbeing of women coffee farmers in the Highlands provinces of Papua New Guinea.

End-of-Project Outcomes

CISP has been designed around CARE International's Gender Equality Framework (GEF), which shows that to achieve sustainable change to women's empowerment, there needs to be a holistic approach that addresses barriers within the domains of agency, relations and structures.

CISP is working towards three end-of-project outcomes (EOPO) that align with the GEF:

1. **Building Women's Agency:** women farmers engage in and benefit from income earning activities
2. **Enabling Supportive Relations:** couples undertake joint decision-making, share workloads and support women's equitable access to productive resources and income
3. **Creating Equitable Opportunities:** gender equitable and inclusive practices are embedded within the coffee industry

To achieve these objectives CARE PNG works in partnership with key coffee industry stakeholders, including private sector exporters, government agencies including the Coffee Industry Corporation (CIC) and community-based coffee cooperatives to build more gender-inclusive programs, policies and practices.

The project has particular focus on supporting coffee cooperatives and farming groups to provide women smallholder farmers and their families with improved livelihood opportunities. The project increases women's access to extension services and improves family business management practices so that smallholder coffee farming families can work together more effectively. This enables the whole family (women, men, girls and boys) to benefit from coffee production and income.

By promoting and working with stakeholders to promote women's role within the industry, CISP contributes to achieving Goal 2 of the Papua New Guinea Medium Term Development Plan 2 (MTDP2)⁶ that aims to support large scale agricultural enterprises and smallholder growers to meet domestic and international needs. CISP also responds to Target 2.3 of the international Sustainable Development Goals, which strives to double the agricultural productivity and incomes of small-scale food producers; in particular, women, indigenous peoples, family farmers, and pastoralists, by 2030.⁷

⁶ Papua New Guinea Department of National Planning and Monitoring. (2015). *Papua New Guinea Medium Term Development Plan 2 (2016–2017)*.

⁷ United Nations General Assembly. (25 September 2015). *Resolution A/RES/70/1*

2.0 METHODOLOGY

2.1 Scope and purpose

The evaluation terms of reference states that the purpose of the evaluation is, *‘to document the impact and proven lessons from CISP. Such lessons will inform similar projects within CARE International, as well as other actors who promote gender equity and women’s economic empowerment in commodity value chains’*.

Specific evaluation objectives include:

- the success of the project to date in achieving its planned outcomes and objectives;
- project impact; and
- lessons learned for project improvement and the extent to which these are being integrated into the project.

The evaluation scope focuses on CISP activities over the three phases or total project period.

2.2 Methodology

The CISP end-of-project evaluation is being conducted over two interconnected phases. Each phase is designed to deliver technical insights, learnings and recommendations in accessible formats.

The rationale for conducting the evaluation over two phases is contextual – phase three of CISP commenced in July 2019 and had a strong focus on strengthening and consolidating government and private sector partnerships established under the first two phases and on ensuring sustainability at the community-level. However, during the first six months of implementation the project faced a number of challenges including reduced funding and significant turnover of technical advisors which both delayed implementation and led to team members meeting multiple responsibilities. Early 2020 saw the global COVID-19 pandemic reach Papua New Guinea and by March 2020 the majority of project activities were delayed or suspended due to lockdowns and travel restrictions. By June 2020 when it was possible to recommence some activities, it was already the coffee harvest season and industry partners and farming families were fully committed to the harvesting and marketing of their coffee so planned activities could not be rescheduled – the season carried through into October 2020. Implementation therefore has only recently gained momentum in November/ December 2020.

Phase 1 (P1) of the evaluation therefore focuses on documenting progress and challenges to date, making recommendations to maximise impact and sustainability by project-end and providing guidance on capturing evidence to support the second phase of the evaluation. P1 was home-based and involved: a meta-analysis of program documentation; qualitative remote key informant interviews and a sense-making and reflection workshop. This P1 evaluation report presents the preliminary findings and recommendations for the remaining period of implementation.

Phase 2 (P2) of the evaluation will focus on documenting the achievements and challenges over the project’s lifetime, but especially during the third phase, identifying promising practices and models and making recommendations for future programming. P2 will combine P1 findings, in-country data collection and analysis resulting in a final evaluation report.

Data Collection Framework

The following data collection framework maps the evaluation objectives and key evaluation questions to the data collection methods to be used across the two phases of the evaluation.

CISP END-OF-PROJECT EVALUATION DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS FRAMEWORK

THEMATIC AREA	EVALUATION OBJECTIVE AND KEY QUESTION	SUB- EVALUATION QUESTIONS	PHASE 1	PHASE 2
			DATA COLLECTION METHODS	DATA COLLECTION METHODS
IMPACT	To what extent did the Project achieve its objectives? What results, expected and unexpected, direct and indirect, were produced by the Project?	Partnerships - Has the Project influenced industry stakeholders to increase priority for women empowerment in their work? - To what extent do Coffee industry stakeholders have increased capacity to address the specific needs of smallholder coffee farming families.	Meta-analysis of program documentation Key Informant Interviews with CISP program staff Key Informant Interviews with industry stakeholders, research partners and donors.	Coffee Smallholder Survey Focus Groups discussions with extension officers, model farming families, fellow farming families. Stories of Change Interviews with extension officers, model farming families.
		Farming Families: - To what extent have smallholder families have improved social and technical capacities to manage their coffee farming? <i>Social:</i> To what extent has been changes in women's participation in decision-making (within the home, within collectives, within community)? <i>Technical:</i> to what extent has coffee husbandry techniques been improved? - To what extent are targeted smallholder families demonstrating increased cooperation and collective action to increase production efficiency as well as enable market opportunities?	Meta-analysis of program documentation Key Informant Interviews with CISP program staff	Coffee Smallholder Survey Focus Groups discussions with extension officers, model farming families, fellow farming families and VSLA group members. Stories of Change Interviews with model farming families and VSLA group members
		Gender - What are the expected/unexpected impacts of the project (both positive and negative) on gender equality? Did this strengthen impact in other areas (such as technical capacity, income, yield, access to market)? - Has there been changes in women's participation in decision-making (within the home, within collectives, within community)?	Meta-analysis of program documentation Key Informant Interviews with CISP program staff	Coffee Smallholder Survey Focus Groups discussions with model farming families, fellow farming families and VSLA group members. Stories of Change Interviews with model farming families and VSLA group members
		Governance	Meta-analysis of program documentation	Focus Groups discussions with model farming families, fellow

THEMATIC AREA	EVALUATION OBJECTIVE AND KEY QUESTION	SUB- EVALUATION QUESTIONS	PHASE 1	PHASE 2
			DATA COLLECTION METHODS	DATA COLLECTION METHODS
		a. What are the expected/unexpected impacts of the project (both positive and negative) on community/group/co-operative level governance? b. How did CARE's approach and outcomes achieve results in regards to governance at different level (VSLA, CIC, private sector and coffee cooperatives)? c. How have changes in governance affected the project's outcomes and impacts?	Key Informant Interviews with CISP program staff Key Informant Interviews with industry stakeholders, research partners and donors.	farming families and VSLA group members. Stories of Change Interviews with model farming families and VSLA group members
MODEL	Has this project produced any proven or promising approaches that could be integrated across future programs?	Is it replicable? What are the key 'ingredients' needed? What are the key enabling factors for change to occur? What are the constraints/challenges?	Meta-analysis of program documentation Key Informant Interviews with CISP program staff Key Informant Interviews with industry stakeholders, research partners and donors.	Meta-analysis of program documentation
SUSTAINABILITY	To what extent are the outcomes and impacts of the CISP project likely to be sustained?	Does investing in gender equality and good governance improve the sustainability of outcomes and impacts?	Meta-analysis of program documentation Key Informant Interviews with CISP program staff Key Informant Interviews with industry stakeholders, research partners and donors.	Coffee Smallholder Survey Focus Groups discussions with model farming families, fellow farming families and VSLA group members.

Data collection methods

Five data collection methods are to be employed across the two evaluation phases:

PHASE 1

1. **Meta-analysis of program documentation:** a meta-analysis of program documentation was undertaken to better understand program implementation as it relates to program outcomes, challenges and learnings to date. Project documentation included: project design and theory of change, project monitoring and evaluation framework, project baseline; project reviews including internal and external mid-term reviews, annual and six-month donor progress reports; learning briefs and action research studies conducted as part of informing a flexible design that evolved over time. The material provided a solid foundation for understanding the contextual drivers of project models, and progress and achievements against intended objectives. Material documenting the impact or sustainability of project models and strategies from programming experience was more limited, and these gaps will inform the focus of the P2 data collection.
2. **Key Informant Interviews (KIs):** KIs enabled the evaluation consultant to gain an understanding of the perspectives, behaviour and motivations of project partners in order to identify the challenges and successes of activities and opportunities going forward. During P1 KIs were held with the following categories of respondent: industry stakeholders, research partners, project staff and donors ensuring a diversity of informed perspectives on different aspects of the project.

PHASE 2

3. **Coffee smallholder/farmer survey:** a coffee smallholder survey will be developed during P2. The survey will be conducted with male and female members of model farming families and cluster families.
4. **Focus Group Discussions (FGDs):** results obtained from the coffee smallholder survey will be combined with qualitative information. FGDs will be used to provide depth to quantitative survey findings and provide insights into differential experiences among the different groups involved in the change process. FGDs will be disaggregated by gender and will be conducted with extension officers, model farming families, cluster fellow farming families, cooperative members and savings group members.
5. **Stories of Change (SoCs):** will capture and demonstrate what is valued through the use of specific individual narratives. Structured with a beginning, middle and end, they will focus changes that have taken place for individuals due to program activities and any unintended changes. SoCs will be conducted with women members of model farming families and women and youth savings group members.

2.3 Limitations

COVID-19: due to travel restrictions P1 of the evaluation was conducted remotely (using platforms such as zoom and skype). This had a number of implications for data collection and analysis. Choices had to be made as to which voices could be included in primary data collection during P1 - it was not possible to collect primary data from program participants due to travel restrictions and social distancing requirements. Consequently, the evaluation has not been able to explore the effectiveness of project approaches and strategies and outcomes from the perspective of participants directly – key informant interview data from interviews with a cross-section of CARE program staff and external stakeholders are the main source of information for this in P1. During P2 of the evaluation primary data collection with project participants will be a focus.

Unanticipated/unexpected outcomes: documentation for the evaluation was centred on monitoring and reporting processes as a way of assessing progress – this means that unexpected outcomes (either positive or negative) were more difficult to capture as part of P1. This will be addressed under Phase 2 of the evaluation.

Structure

P1 of the evaluation seeks to provide a foundational understanding of program relevance, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. It draws on available documentation to make a preliminary assessment of achievements and promising approaches and/or practices. At the same time, the report points to areas for further exploration during P2 and where effectiveness might be improved and impact deepened and sustained during the remaining period of implementation, and where other innovations and ways of working might be explored.

The remainder of this report outlines:

- Key findings for P1 using the overarching criteria of relevance, effectiveness, impact and sustainability.
- A proposed approach and methodology for P2 of the evaluation.

3.0 FINDINGS

3.1 Relevance

Relevance to smallholder farming families

PNG's economy is predominately agricultural, with the majority of the population dependent on subsistence farming, despite the production of export crops such as coffee. The country has a large coffee production system, with 470,000 coffee smallholder families. Coffee is also PNG's principle export, earning over PGK 460 million per year. As such it has immense potential to improve the status and income of women and men in farming families. Studies that have assessed gender roles in agriculture in PNG agree that women in PNG perform the bulk of agricultural labour, being responsible for up to 80% of food crop production and more than 60% of cash crop production. Despite this, women receive on average less than a third of the income from coffee as that of their male counterparts. They are also constrained by unequal access to productive resources and extension services. The project's focus on the interrelated issues of poverty and livelihood opportunities in rural communities is relevant not just in terms of improved wellbeing for all, but particularly in terms of improvements to gender roles and relations around the status and position of women.

Relevance to the private sector

In PNG, the private sector has been playing an increasingly important role both within the government regulatory framework and in providing support to coffee growers. The main coffee exporters work with up to 19,000 growers of which 13,500 reside in the Eastern Highlands Province. Recent research found that offering extension services, farming-related activities and socio-economic support could strengthen relationships between producers and buyers and therefore guarantee supply. Such private enterprise initiatives are also in the coffee sector's interest as they open up the opportunity for the participating groups to increase the both quantity and quality of coffee. Further incentive for private sector interest in supporting coffee smallholders lies in the global financial success of certified products and PNG's potential for expansion in this area. Labelling certifications such as Fair Trade, Rainforest Alliance and UTZ allow consumers to identify coffee that meets agreed environmental, labour and developmental standards. Certification provides consumers with assurance that products are genuinely benefitting growers at the end of the supply chain as it involves independent auditing to ensure compliance with the agreed standards. Addressing gender equity and social development in the PNG coffee industry adds value to coffee by aligning it with the non-discrimination aspects of the certification processes. Companies to which PNG exporters supply coffee such as Tchibo (Germany), Dallmayr (Germany) and Nestle provide added impetus as they also are interested in social projects within coffee-producing communities. The project's central focus on private sector partnerships to ensure they deliver inclusive services to coffee smallholders and to ensure men and women benefit equally from coffee production, is highly relevant.

Relevance to national government policies and programs

The Medium-Term Development Plan III (MTDP3) for the Government of PNG (2018-2022) includes several key areas that CISP not only aligns with, but is supporting to achieve. In particular, CISP contributes to the cross-cutting sector of Gender. Under MTDP3 CISP contributes to empowering women to participate economically in PNG's development and the promotion of the Gender Equality and Social Inclusion (GESI) initiative for mainstreaming into the public service sector. CISP also contributes to key sector strategies: increase women's access to economic opportunities and awareness of their economic rights; and enhance opportunities for equality in employment, education and other socio-economic activities.

Within the MTDP3 Economic Sector, Agriculture, the project aligns with the coffee sector goal to support the development of a sustainable and competitive coffee industry in PNG, which will maximise financial returns to coffee producers and contribute to government's economic and social policy goals. CISP supports two of the key ways in which the government plans to do this: establishing partnerships with the private sector; and providing legislative and policy frameworks. CISP contributes directly to at least four of the sector strategies:

- Provide extension/training/business support services to cooperatives and smallholder farmers (SMEs, Youth and Women)
- Support Integrated farming, food security and sustainable livelihood
- Defence against pests and diseases of coffee
- Support market access infrastructure and service delivery

CISP also supports the goals of the Economic Sector, Small Medium Enterprise and the Economic Sector, Financial Inclusion. CISP supports the development of micro small medium enterprises (MSME), empowers local entrepreneurs and contributes to improving quality of lives of people. CISP's financial literacy training and VSLA+ methodology increase opportunities for women and men to save money and access loans.

The Coffee Industry Corporation (CIC) is the PNG government-mandated regulatory, research, training and extension, and promotion body for coffee. CISP is using the Gender Equity and Social Inclusion (GESI) policy as an entry point to align and engage more meaningfully with the CIC in the development of more gender equitable policies at all levels from recruitment to extension services within the coffee supply chain.

3.2 Effectiveness

EOP OUTCOME 1: BUILDING WOMEN'S AGENCY

Women farmers engage in and benefit from income earning activities

PROGRESS

IO1.1 Women farmers have increased financial literacy, numeracy and business management knowledge and skills

Agricultural support services, infrastructure and banking services are almost non-existent for the majority of smallholder coffee farmers in the Highlands, in particular women farmers. The project baseline study found that only 40% of households surveyed had accounts with a financial institution, and many of those households were members of established farmer networks and living in areas with comparatively easy access to urban centres. For those households with financial accounts, only 25% were operated or accessed by women.⁸ During its second phase, the project successfully adapted and piloted village savings and loans associations (VSLAs) or savings groups for the PNG context. Savings groups are specifically designed to offer entry-level financial services in remote areas with limited infrastructure and low levels of education.

CISP has taken a value-add approach in adapting the VSLA model for implementation in the Highlands. Using a VSLA+ model, the project provides Family Business Management Training (FBMT) and Financial Literacy Training (FLT) as a foundational package for savings groups. Savings groups are either women-only or mixed groups (in which 60% of members must be women and three of five leadership positions must be filled by women). The Family Business Management Training (FBMT) has been developed to break down barriers to women's economic empowerment at the household level. Families attend the training together (usually husband and wife) and explore a range of topics covering decision-making, communication skills, conflict management, and household budgeting. The training supports families to understand the value of working together, in particular recognising the important role that women play in the household. By the end of the training couples have developed their 'famili driman' (family goal) and identified the steps they will take together to achieve this. The financial literacy training (FLT) complements the FBMT, and has been adapted by the project to specifically target women in rural areas with low literacy and/or numeracy. The training is games-based and helps women to understand how they can start or scale-up small business activities and the importance of financial management and budgeting. Together FBMT and FLT provide women with an opportunity to increase their numeracy, financial literacy and confidence to engage in savings and income earning activities. The FBMT is particularly important to gain husband's support for their wife's engagement, and mitigate risks of violence that may emerge from her participation. At the time of P1 of the evaluation, 469 men and 352 women had received FBMT (2015-2020) and 116 women and 114 men had received FLT (2017-2020).

P1 of the evaluation found evidence that women have increased their financial literacy, numeracy and business management skills. Both men and women savings group members report that they have gained or improved their financial skills through attending the combination of FLT and FBMT. Members state that they are much more conscious of household budgeting and are practising the skill of allocating money to spending on needs versus wants that has enabled them to put aside money. Members state the training has enabled them to plan and adopt the practice of budgeting which means 'savings and loans are put to work' in order to move them towards their family goals of small business

⁸ CARE International in PNG. 2016. *Coffee Industry Support Project Baseline*. Internal document.

or home improvements. Many members noted that the link between the FBMT visioning exercise (femili driman) and the savings group itself was useful for 'building a road from the vision to reality'. Members also report feeling more confident in skills such as bookkeeping and record keeping, running meetings, though this seems to be the case more for men rather than women.⁹

IO1.2 Women farmers have increased savings and access to loans

Based on the success of the initial pilot, the project has scaled-up the savings groups methodology and there are now 15 established savings groups – one group all-male; five groups are all-women and ten are mixed groups. Overall membership of savings groups is 66% women and 34% men. Within the mixed groups, women's membership either dominates 3:1 or is equal to that of men's membership. Of the 15 groups, five are in their first cycle; three are entering their second cycle, and seven are entering their third cycle. At the time of P1 of the evaluation, savings groups have cumulatively shared out over PGK 174,385 (approx. USD48, 450) over the period 2017-2020.

Women savings group members were motivated to join after learning about the potential economic benefits in the initial project community awareness and mobilization sessions. The most common explanation for women joining was that they are more aware of household needs and difficulties and therefore they are more willing to take a risk in trying something new if they see possible economic benefits for the family. Men savings group members were motivated for a range of reasons including: being convinced by their spouse of the potential economic benefits; concerns and/or curiosity about their wives' activities in the group; and the belief that male members would bring in more money for larger loans.¹⁰

P1 of the evaluation found that men and women members are reporting an increase in their income through taking and using loans for small business activities with a subsequent increase in returns. Women members in particular, report material and economic benefits from being part of the savings groups – a majority of women report that this is the first time they have been able to access small amounts of credit suited to their needs and repayment abilities. Across all savings groups, income generation was listed as the first priority for loans under the constitution, and loans were most frequently used for a productive investment related to agricultural activities – usually livestock raising, and coffee and vegetable gardens. Using the loan for education or were also common second or third priorities nominated by the groups. Loan uses by women to date have centred around investing in small-scale informal marketing activities at roadside or village markets such as the sale of cooked food, sale of betel nuts, lime, mustard, cigarettes and store goods bought in bulk and packaged for resale at slightly higher prices; the purchase of seeds for their food gardens and the payment of school fees. Loan uses by men to date have centred around the purchase of agricultural inputs such as pesticides, weedicides fertilizer for coffee blocks and food gardens and seeds/seedlings for cash crops such as potatoes, onions, peanuts.¹¹

P1 of the evaluation found that the majority of members report reinvesting around half of their increased earnings back into the savings groups through purchasing shares and increasing their savings for the eventual share-out. Using the knowledge and skills from attending FBMT and FLT, savings group members indicate that they are making long-term plans for the larger lump sums to be gained from savings and share-out. Long-term investment plans included expanding small businesses through value-add inputs such as processing and packaging for rice or betel nut; the purchase of

⁹ Huxtable, J. 2018. *Women Mean Business. Empowering women through savings groups in Papua New Guinea*. CARE International in PNG.

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Ibid.

coolers for fish to sell at local markets; or expanding existing business reach to different markets; children's education; home improvements; and the leasing or purchase of land or agricultural equipment and inputs.¹²

Notably, P1 of the evaluation found that all savings groups have continued to save during COVID-19, despite difficulties in earning money due to lockdowns and travel restrictions. Members have reported that savings groups provided the only avenue for members to receive loans to support their families during the COVID-19 lockdown period and to restart their activities after the lockdown.¹³

While savings groups provide an entry-level opportunity for women to access financial services, over time women may wish to access more sizeable loans and finance for their businesses. However, basic analysis of financial services in PNG shows them to be currently inappropriate for most women. During this phase of the project a gender analysis of the financial services sector was planned to gain a better understanding of opportunities to support women within the sector. Results are to be shared with women farmers and cooperatives and may form the basis for future programming to influence provision of financial services to be more gender-equitable and inclusive. The financial services analysis was to be conducted by an external consultant and was scheduled to take place in early 2020, however due to COVID-19 this activity has been delayed.¹⁴

IO1.3 Women farmers have more diverse income earning activities

During the first two phases of the project, it became clear that although coffee farming is the largest reliable source of income for the majority of farming families, overall net income from coffee is not enough to support their household year-round. Non-coffee income complements nearly every coffee farming family's livelihood – often coffee farmers themselves are also petty traders, livestock raisers or service providers. The project found that the availability of opportunities is one of the main factors determining household resilience. Women farmers report that it has been difficult to expand or start small businesses due to, firstly limited opportunities and demand for products in their area, and secondly, what they see to be their own limited skills and knowledge on marketing and product development.¹⁵

The project has sought to diversify income sources within model farming families through introducing apiculture to over 100 farming families. Technical trainings attended by women (45%) and men (55%) cover topics such as: second and third hive story building; honey harvesting and quality control; hive inspections and pest control; and guidance and advice on bee swarm control. There are now 11 established apiculture model farming families in Unggai Bena District (8) and Kainantu District (3). Model farming families have successfully applied the skills and knowledge gained in trainings with extracted honey rating between 16-17% moisture content – considered to be the highest quality honey. Model farming families in Unggai Bena and Kainantu Districts have established a direct partnership with New Guinea Fruits Company and have so far sold 229kg of honey for PGK 2294 (approx. USD 640).¹⁶

¹² Ibid.

¹³ CARE International in PNG. 2020. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report January-June 2020*. Internal document.

¹⁴ CARE International in PNG. 2020. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report January-June 2020*. Internal document.

¹⁵ Huxtable, J. 2018. *Women Mean Business. Empowering women through savings groups in Papua New Guinea*. CARE International in PNG.

¹⁶ CARE International in PNG. 2019. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report January-June 2020*. Internal document.

During this phase of the project, a local gender-sensitive market analysis and business development study was planned. The study aims to identify viable income earning activities for individual women and what steps they can take to establish their small business. Ongoing business management support and guidance will then be provided to women to support them to establish and maintain their business. The market-analysis was to be conducted by an external consultant and was scheduled to take place in early 2020, however due to COVID-19 travel restrictions this activity has been delayed.¹⁷

Nevertheless, P1 of the evaluation found that whilst women farmers have not yet significantly diversified their *individual* income sources, they have participated in the *expansion of family enterprises* through apiculture or the expansion of coffee cropping areas, or value-adding through marketing and processing activities. For example, as model farming families gain experience and confidence (see IO1.4), they have used their position and knowledge to either 1) expand their existing coffee production activities through cultivating more land or 2) apply their new skills in farm management to other small-scale cash crops such as brown onions, cabbages as well as small-scale poultry and livestock production. Model farming families are also more likely to engage in value-adding activities of selling ripe cherries such as processing and drying thereby increasing their income further. As one model farming family described it, *'we are definitely expanding, we have asked our relatives who are not using their existing gardens if we can rehabilitate and manage their gardens ourselves, but then give back a certain proportion of the harvest to them'*. Another model farming family stated, *'we are planning to plant brown onions and cabbages and other vegetables to sell. We have started poultry that is looking after chickens to sell also – we want to expand this'*.¹⁸ Finally, one model farming family stated, *'in the past our coffee was sold mostly as cherries. Since becoming a model farming family, we are now able to complete the post-harvest processing up to dry parchment coffee'*.

IO1.4 Women farmers undertake agricultural and livelihoods activities with more skill

One of the constraints to increasing women coffee farmer's more meaningful engagement along the coffee value chain is their ability to access extension services. Extension officers directly support farmers and share knowledge to improve their farming techniques. They are important intermediaries between the private sector, research and farmers, promoting better results and better profits for all stakeholders along the coffee value chain. Within PNG, the provision and support for agricultural extension is largely a government responsibility, however there has been a steady decline in budgetary support since the 1990's leading to a fragmented extension system with limited coverage and a deteriorating quality of services. Lack of human resource capacity in the national extension service is a major factor affecting the level and quality of service delivery and this is most apparent in provincial extension services, where budget constraints have drastically reduced staff numbers over two decades. Consequently, the participation of agricultural industries in the delivery of extension services to farmers has gained momentum and the industry extension model can be seen across the coffee, cocoa and palm oil industries. However, industry driven extension services tend to be restricted to their own farmer networks. Where government and/or industry-driven extension services are provided, they have traditionally been top-down focusing on the transfer of new agricultural technologies and research to farmers to improve their production, with little attention given to broader farm management and business development skills.

¹⁷ CARE International in PNG. 2020. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report January-June 2020*. Internal document.

¹⁸ Huxtable, J. 2019. *Cultivating Equality. Model farming families lead the way in Papua New Guinea*. CARE International in PNG.

Within this context, community-based extension approaches have become increasingly important in reaching small-scale marginalised women and men coffee farmers. The project has developed and successfully introduced the Model Farming Family Extension Approach (MFFEA) to address these issues. MFFEA takes the traditional farmer-to-farmer extension approach and moves beyond simple technical message delivery through individual farmers, to instead making farming families principal agents of change in their own communities through building skills and knowledge in a combination of technical and social content. It promotes the creation of balanced households through using the family unit as the model within their cooperatives and their wider community as a whole. This approach recognizes that coffee farming in PNG is a family business and that both women and men should have equal opportunities to access extension services as there are clearly defined roles within coffee production for women and men. The concept encourages farming families to work together, make farm production and sale decisions jointly, and harnesses each family members strengths in managing the family farm for greater productivity and income generation. In doing so, the approach aims to integrate both women and men into the decision-making and management functions of the family farm and explicitly recognizes the importance of women across all aspects of coffee as a family business.

The project selects model farming families based on a set of criteria which include desirable social attributes of households in addition to the availability of household productive resources. Once model farming families are identified, training is delivered using the tailored Model Farming Family Extension Training Manual which covers six modules including: 1. How to Facilitate Conversation Among Farmers; 2: Managing Family Dynamics; 3. How to facilitate farmer to farmer learning; 4. Coffee Husbandry Practices; 5. Farm Management Practices; and 6. Reporting and Learning Together. These modules have been designed to be delivered over 5 days and represent foundational training for the selected model farming families. The training develops model farming family understanding and skills in adult learning principles and how to transfer the social concepts and technical coffee farming techniques through conversation or demonstration to fellow farming families. The foundation training complements and reinforces the other social (FBMT) and technical (coffee husbandry) trainings that model farming families receive.

Following the foundation training, the technical extension program is delivered over the duration of the seasonal coffee calendar for applied learning in real-time. This highlights another unique aspect of the MFFEA approach in that training is delivered consistently and continuously over a season rather than in a single intensive upfront training. Technical modules are delivered in four phases and each phase integrates social modules e.g., typical training day will cover one technical module such as 'soil management and coffee rehabilitation' and one social module such as 'setting up and planning on a family vision'. Each extension phase is completed over four days with each model farming family in their own household and coffee garden environment.

The project has directly supported 15 women farmers and 15 men farmers within 15 model farming families in Eastern Highlands Province, and the outcomes have been significant in both scale and depth.

P1 of the evaluation found that the majority of model farming families have adopted the practices and techniques delivered through the training. The most commonly applied techniques by model farming families were the 'Coffee Rehabilitation' packages in particular the construction of proper drainage; pruning of branches to encourage cherry growth; and 'Coffee Harvesting and Processing' in particular cherry-picking techniques, pulping and drying processes. Other topics mentioned included intercropping and sucker selection. The high uptake of practices is likely to be due to the fact that MFFEA focusses on techniques that have tangible results, and that are immediate and significant enough to convince farmers to try out and continue a practice. As one model farming family stated,

'learning why we do the seven-rehabilitation package in the coffee garden and its importance was an eye opener for us'.¹⁹

The evaluation also found that model farming families have been central in the adoption of various coffee production techniques by fellow farming families. This is because the approach is based on the assumption that farmers can effectively disseminate information because they have an in-depth knowledge of local conditions and culture and are known by fellow farming families and therefore have their trust. They live in the community, speak the same language, and use expressions that suit their context. The promotion of pruning for cherry growth was listed by almost all model farming families as the most frequently shared topic, followed by cherry-picking techniques and pulping and dry processing. As one model farming family stated, *'we have certainly shared to other families. The skills and knowledge gained from MFF has been shared; we also have equipment such as secateurs for pruning, saw, spades, bush knives, and pulping machine that we share for rehabilitation and management'.²⁰*

P1 of the evaluation found evidence that the high adoption of project promoted techniques, has led to enhanced coffee production and quality. The majority of model farming families reported that they had observed significant improvements in both quantity and quality of coffee produced in model gardens. Almost half of model farming families reported that pruning and notching was the most successful technique they were actively promoting, with trees now producing increased cherry yields and improved access for harvesting. For example, the Kona-Bena MFFs report that they have tripled production - previously they were producing only 12kg of parchment coffee but after applying the new techniques they are now producing 50kg of parchment coffee. Meanwhile in Masuma, model farming families report doubling production from a previous harvest of one 60kg bag to a recent harvest of two 60kg bags. The majority of model farming families also report that quality has improved with larger cherries and denser beans. For example, one model farming family stated, *'we say it is quality because before we saw that we picked very small cherries and when we pulped it was very small. Now it has changed. The cherries are bigger and beans when pulped and dry are also big'. Another family shared that, 'the most important change we both have seen is the trees after we have pruned them are at a level where we can pick the cherries. Before my wife had to pull the branches down. Now we stand and pick the cherries. We have also seen that the coffee beans are bigger, before they were small and there were a lot of floaters now, we don't see a lot of floaters'.²¹*

Finally, P1 of the evaluation found that leading on from increases in coffee production/quality, the majority of model farming families have also increased their agricultural incomes specifically from coffee. Increased income is being used for household needs such as the purchase of kitchen utensils, bedding and clothing as well as house improvements such as the purchase of iron roofing or solar panels. One model farming family in Masuma has made longer-term investments in sending their daughter to university and using the income to support payment of fees, *'the quality is definitely seen to be improved – floaters (beans too light and float) are reduced or even not sighted. Dried beans are clean and full – the beans are fetching a much higher price now than before being an MFF'.²²*

¹⁹ Huxtable, J. 2019. *Cultivating Equality. Model farming families lead the way in Papua New Guinea*. CARE International in PNG.

²⁰ Ibid.

²¹ Ibid.

²² Ibid.

CHALLENGES

Participation and influence of women leaders within savings group committees: the intention was that three out of five committee positions would be held by women in mixed savings groups. Currently there are between 2-3 women on the management committees for the eight mixed groups, though women often hold the role of key holder in these groups. Phase 1 of the evaluation found that although there has been an increase in women's representation on savings groups management committees. Their ability to participate and influence decision-making and governance processes remains limited. This is likely to be due to the context where women in particular have very low literacy rates meaning they are not confident or do not have the skillset required to fulfil the role of record keeper or chairperson. Even though women are encouraged to take on leadership roles, most often women report that they do not have the confidence despite having received some basic literacy and numeracy training. Women's own perception of men taking leadership roles persists, and therefore most are reluctant to take up leadership roles. Furthermore, although gender dynamics may be slowly shifting at the household level, it can longer than one to two cycles for this to occur at the community level.

High expectations of fellow farming families: model farming families have noted that the 'expectations of fellow farming families' were sometimes a challenge both in terms of sharing knowledge and continuing their work. Despite the fact that model farming families are selected from within the community by the partner cooperative, there is a lack of understanding that their role is voluntary and that they do not receive a salary, stipend or any materials from the project itself. Presently, fellow farming families see the model farming family as an 'extension' of CARE and have expectations that the model farming families are responsible for providing them with tools, fertilisers and equipment. Whilst model farming families are willing to undertake their role voluntarily based on non-financial incentives such as increased knowledge and skills and opportunities to travel, they are ill-prepared to answer questions regarding the absence of tools and inputs that would support farmers in applying newly acquired skills. This has resulted in confusion and some model farming families questioning whether they should continue.

Constraints on women farmers ability to disseminate information to other women farmers: all of the women model farmers indicated that they are only able to conduct an on-site visit to a woman fellow farmer together with their husband, and conversely a woman fellow farmer can only request a visit once she has the permission of her husband – this is because land is seen as belonging to men and thus coffee gardens are also seen as belonging to men. Therefore, whilst the approach has increased the availability of extension services for women through gender-balanced model farming families, access to these services is still dependent on the support of men. This indicates that barriers to women participating in and benefiting from coffee extension services lies deeper than their availability and that the approach may need a clearer strategy for strengthening women's ability to disseminate information to other women.

Wider challenges within the coffee supply chain: whilst it is clear that the coffee management and rehabilitation training being delivered to and disseminated by model farming families is addressing a gap in extension services, there remain a number of other significant constraints to coffee production in the Highlands. Model farming families are already raising issues around the fact that many coffee trees are maturing (over 20 years old) and the limited availability of appropriate replacement seedlings; the outbreak of the Coffee Berry Borer (CBB); and the effects of climate change such as longer dry seasons and unpredictable rainy seasons which affect the flowering and cherries filling stages which in turn leads to poor yields in quality and quantity.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Women's leadership: complementary gender-specific activities are needed to address the existing gender inequalities hindering women's ability to fully participate in and benefit from savings groups. In particular, moving into future cycles the project should consider how it can promote women's leadership through skill building and changes in perceptions of women leaders. Programming that integrates specific nonfinancial empowerment capacity-building components during the first and second cycles and that is tailored to the specific disadvantage's women face when participating in savings groups is critical. For example, the FLT already addresses women's low literacy and numeracy for improved skills and knowledge. However, there would be benefit in providing targeted leadership training to women themselves in public speaking, in negotiation, communication and assertiveness.

Rather than promote linkages with financial services provider, empower savings group members to make good choices based on their interests and demands: while building relationships with formal financial institutions has not traditionally been a central objective of savings group programming, members increasingly recognise the benefits that these relationships may bring, such as security for excess liquidity, long-term savings, and access to larger loans. However, given the remaining time for implementation the project may consider revising the focus of the financial services sector analysis. Significant due diligence is required when facilitating linkages or promoting products associated with financial service providers and such guidance is unlikely to stand the test of time as financial service providers continually modify, remove and add products to their packages. Rather, resources could be used to expand financial literacy training to a more comprehensive financial education training. For savings group members entering into relationships with formal financial service providers, financial education is widely believed to be a necessary component of their preparation. Members need to understand how financial service providers work, what they offer, and what they require of clients. Financial education should empower members to ask the right questions and choose both the providers and the products that are right for them. Trainers also play a crucial role in empowering members to make informed decisions and must themselves be educated on risks and opportunities.

Gender-sensitive market analysis: the terms of reference for the gender-sensitive market analysis should be expanded – in addition to considering local income-generating opportunities the analysis could consider opportunities for women to participate in the higher-value parts of the coffee supply chain e.g., processing, marketing; and acting as input suppliers such as being part of nursery establishment.

Strategy for women model farmers to disseminate information to other women: the model farming family extension approach should consider developing group extension as a part of the model. This is where individual model farmer-to-fellow farmer contact is complemented by group contact, especially, but not only, where it may be difficult for women model farmers to have contact with fellow women farmers in coffee gardens other than their own, or where it may be difficult for women farmers to visit households other than their own relatives freely. Group contact can significantly increase women's access, because the group context minimises the concerns of women about transgressing norms of approved social contact. This may involve pairing women farmers from different model farming families to work as a team.

EOP OUTCOME 2: ENABLING SUPPORTIVE RELATIONS

Couples undertake joint decision-making, share workloads and support women's equitable access to productive resources and assets

PROGRESS

IO2.1 Women have decreased workloads and participate more in household decision-making

P1 of the evaluation found evidence of social norms change in household attitudes and behaviours that enable women to more equitably participate in and benefit from the family coffee smallholding. The main changes in social norms centre around changes in 1) household labour with a more equal distribution of labour between men and women through a more collaborative approach to managing the coffee garden and the household and 2) combined decision-making on the use of household income. These changes are attributed to the knowledge and skills gained by women and men farmers through the FBM and FLT packages discussed under IO1.1.

Regarding the equitable distribution of productive and domestic workloads, men are taking on tasks within the household previously considered taboo such as washing, cooking and caring for children, while women now have the technical knowledge to perform tasks in the coffee garden such as pruning previously done by men – this shift in the division of work has led to changing attitudes where the work done by women in coffee gardens is seen as being as valuable as that of men, and that women should therefore share in decision-making over the production and sale of coffee, as well as how to use the money that comes from sales. Model farming families report that communication between husbands and wives is occurring more regularly, with important improvements in the way their families now manage their finances jointly. One model farming family described the change, *'before my husband used to do nothing. He would waste his time doing things that did not benefit the family. So, I use to do decisions concerning coffee on my own. When the CARE team brought in the trainings he changed. Now we both do the decisions together. My husband helps me to do the work and we get things done. This has changed now because we now see the importance of working together'*.²³

Women and men members of savings groups also reported that being a member of the savings group has meant women are able gain the skills needed to budget and this combined with an independent source of credit through the savings group, has given them more status and influence on decisions relating to the expenditure of family money.²⁴

These findings are supported by extension officers and farmer network leaders who have confirmed that since attending training, they have observed women and men within farming families working better together in the coffee gardens, creating budgets and using them to save income from coffee sales and other income sources.²⁵

IO2.2 Husbands support their wives to engage in their own income earning activities

Based on the available data it was not possible to make an assessment of spousal support or otherwise for women to engage in their own *individual* income earning activities, and this will therefore be a focus of the data collection for P2 of the evaluation. Furthermore, as noted under IO1.3 women members of model farming families and savings groups have not yet made significant progress in establishing their

²³ Huxtable, J. 2019. *Cultivating Equality. Model farming families lead the way in Papua New Guinea*. CARE International in PNG.

²⁴ Huxtable, J. 2018. *Women Mean Business. Empowering women through savings groups in Papua New Guinea*. CARE International in PNG.

²⁵ Pacific Women. 2017. *CARE International in PNG Coffee Industry Support Project Mid-term Evaluation Report*. CARE International in PNG.

own small enterprises/businesses due to limited opportunities and demands for products in their area, and secondly, what they see to be their own limited skills and knowledge on marketing and product development. Women in model farming families have however, been *equal partners* in the expansion and diversification of family income-generation opportunities.

Nevertheless, P1 of the evaluation did find supportive attitudes within the household and community that are likely to encourage women in establishing future small businesses. For example, savings group members report that there is a growing perception at a broader level that women are capable money managers. Savings group members commented that whilst ‘women have always been good managers of money they have not been able to show case their potential until the savings group activities gave them that opportunity’. As one woman savings group member stated, ‘*previously my family never trusts me with money and other marketing items. Now, after I joined this group and am able to do my own small market, they start to trust me and are entrusting me with their own items for sale*’.²⁶ Another woman member noted, ‘*Everyone watched her with interest – like a role model. She is very successful with her small marketing from the money she took from the savings group loan. She says her business is very successful. Mi hamamas na market blo mi em grow lo moni mi kisim*’.²⁷

IO2.3 There are more opportunities for women farmers and their families to learn about coffee farming and working together as a family

Model farming families play an important role in sharing and role modelling the principles and practices of equality within the household beyond their own family unit, and creating and inspiring change within other fellow farming families. The project supports model farming families to hold community events to share their knowledge and experiences. During community events model farming families share what they have learnt and applied in their own coffee gardens (technical) and families (joint decision-making about sharing workloads and household expenditure using coffee income) with the rest of the community to raise their awareness about the issues and importantly, generate interest among other farmers for continued learning through visiting model coffee gardens or by asking a model farming family member to visit their own coffee garden. These community events are co-facilitated by CARE together with model farming families, and are attended by fellow farming families, leaders of the community and local extension service providers. Community events are hosted for between four to five days – morning sessions include training in social modules through story-telling and afternoon sessions include training in technical modules including a field trip to the model garden and field demonstrations.

These community events have been successful in creating an environment where fellow farming families can firstly reflect on their own family decision-making and communication processes and be inspired to create change and secondly those with lower adoption rates can be encouraged to try the improved practices in the next season. As one male fellow farmer described it, ‘*The first play showed how we invite problems into our own families. From the way we talk and respond to each other in regards to decision-making in the family – that can affect us positively or negatively. The second play showed how we can avoid these kinds of problems in our homes – simply the tone of our voice and how we relate to each other matters – good communication can lead to the family being strong and living and working happily*’. Model farming families and fellow farming families together with field

²⁶ Huxtable, J. 2018. *Women Mean Business. Empowering women through savings groups in Papua New Guinea*. CARE International in PNG.

²⁷ CARE International in PNG. 2020. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report January-June 2020*. Internal document.

officers can make plans to address any challenges they are facing. At the time of P1 of the evaluation, a total of nine community events had been held.

The evaluation also found that model farming family role modelling is not limited to community events but is observed on a day-to-day basis within communities. Model farming families are viewed positively by fellow farming families – they are seen as not only knowledgeable and capable farmers who can provide needed assistance to others, but also ‘models’ for family harmony and wellbeing. Fellow farming families have developed respect for model farming families due to the fact that they have been able to observe the changes within the family and the coffee gardens over time – this means that fellow farming families can relate to the original situation of the model farming family leading to the perception that everyone ‘can change’. For example, one fellow farming family described it as *‘the other families have been relating to them as leaders and with the positive changes happening in their lives – they are so very happy. The families here see them as models to learn from’*. Another fellow farming family noted *‘Before they used to quarrel a lot. I used to hear cups, spoons and plates thrown around in their kitchen. Now I have seen that the way they live has changed. They are happier and this has been recognized by other people in the community. We see them as our role models and some of us have taken steps to change certain attitudes’*.²⁸

Male model farmers have noted there are challenges and resistance in role modelling positive attitudes and behaviour, but many are determined to continue leading by example. For example, one male model farmer commented, *‘I do receive criticisms from other men in the community especially when I help my wife carry my new born daughter while she does other things. However, I call those men together and we sit and I talk to them about the things I learned in Family Business Management training.... I tell them women are equally important and so, if we want to develop Papua New Guinea, let’s put aside the old ideas and thoughts we have’*.²⁹

CISP has also developed and broadcast a 12-episode program on local radio throughout Eastern and Western Highlands Provinces. The program aired between 2015-2017 and each 30-minute episode provides 15 minutes of technical information to support farmers and a 15-minute instalment of the family comedy ‘Kofi Raun Wantaim Manu na Grace’. The comedy follows the adventures of a coffee farming couple as they learn to work together better to get more out of their coffee farm. CISP implemented a messaging system for listeners to send in feedback and responses to questions that are included in each episode by mobile phone to monitor audience responses. The broadcast was successful with listeners following the episodes and responding in ways that indicated people were hearing the messages. For example, in response to a question about the key lessons from one episode, a male listener texted ‘I think men should respect their wives because they have done a lot to support us’. The radio program reached an estimated audience of 45,000 people.

During the current phase, the project sought to improve the coverage and reach of the radio program through working in partnership with the National Broadcasting Radio (NBC). However, due to COVID-19, the broadcast of the program has been delayed as the national broadcaster shifted the majority of community segments to disseminating COVID-19 awareness and information sessions.³⁰

²⁸ Huxtable, J. 2019. *Cultivating Equality. Model farming families lead the way in Papua New Guinea*. CARE International in PNG.

²⁹ Pacific Women. 2017. *CARE International in PNG Coffee Industry Support Project Mid-term Evaluation Report*.

³⁰ CARE International in PNG. 2020. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report January-June 2020*. Internal document.

CHALLENGES

Confidence of model farming families to engage others in socio-cultural barriers to coffee production: traditional values and customs that reinforce gender inequality are deeply embedded in communities and it will take time to bring about change among coffee farming families. The model farming family approach is relevant as working on gender equality requires the participation and engagement of both men and women and because it deals with society as a whole. However, the topic can also evoke emotion since gender roles make up personal identities and deal with social roles that are largely a product of culture and determine the way in which people organise their lives.

Given that model farming families are only starting to be norm aware themselves, they are likely to face challenges when engaging with fellow farming households on topics such as shared decision-making and labour – this is supported by a previous review which found that while nearly all model farming families report being confident and capable of sharing information and advice regarding the technical aspects of coffee production (pruning, harvesting, pulping, drying) only two model farming families interviewed indicated that they also shared information on the social aspects of coffee production (collective decision-making on household income and budgeting, time management and labour division).³¹

RECOMMENDATIONS

Provide intensive support for model farming families in conducting FBMT sessions: it is recommended that the project continue to deliver FBMT during community events but instead deliver a component of the FBMT over one full day to the community under each of the four training phases (rather than during a single community event). This would mean that during each of the four training visits the field officer would spend: one day with the model farming family on technical topics in their model garden; one day with the model farming family on social norms change topics; one day delivering a component of FBMT with the community as a whole; and one day reviewing the process with the model farming family. This format would allow for more consistent messaging and provide more support for model farming families in discussing these topics.

³¹ Huxtable, J. 2019. *Cultivating Equality. Model farming families lead the way in Papua New Guinea*. CARE International in PNG.

EOP OUTCOME 3: CREATING EQUITABLE OPPORTUNITIES

Gender equitable and inclusive practices are embedded and institutionalised within the coffee industry

PROGRESS

IO3.1 Coffee extension services are more gender equitable and inclusive

Private sector partners provide extension services to farmers with the objectives of increasing productivity and quality, and because of its importance as an export crop, the government through CIC, dedicates resources to agricultural and market training for coffee producers. However, these services seldom reach the women who are at the heart of coffee cultivation. The reality of the sector is that very few industry partners providing extension services, understand or address gendered social norms and the barriers they create for women's access to, and use of, extension services. The project's approach of promoting the family unit and combining training and knowledge generation on both the technical and social dimensions of coffee production is therefore unique.

Whilst the model farming family extension approach has increased the project's reach to communities that have limited or no access to extension services, CISP has also built strong and productive relationships with key industry stakeholders in the government (CIC) and three of the four specialist coffee exporters in PNG – New Guinea Highlands Coffee Exporters (NGHCE), Sustainable Management Services (SMS) and PNG Coffee Exporters (PNGCE). These partners report that they have benefited significantly from the partnership, particularly in relation to the provision of gender inclusive and appropriate extension services to their farmer networks.

The project has supported and strengthened the capacity of private sector partners to develop specific extension service protocols for engaging and supporting women farmers. For example, a significant outcome of the project is the uptake of the Family Business Management Training (FBMT) package by private sector partners. SMS has adopted modules on 'families working together' (domestic and productive workloads; recognition and valuing of women's role in coffee); 'financial decision-making' (sharing of family income; family well-being priorities; budgeting) and 'communication skills' (listening to each other; respecting each other; making decisions together) and integrated them into its own 'Coffee Curriculum' which is delivered bi-annually across its farmer networks. The project provided initial support and accompaniment to SMS-PNG extension officers, however by this third phase of the project the SMS extension team are capable of conducting FBMT independently. The adoption of these core modules into an existing curriculum with dedicated human and financial resources will achieve significant scale and reach as well as sustainability – SMS-PNG currently has four farmer networks across Jiwaka, Eastern Highlands and Morobe provinces.

Recently, CIC has expressed its intention to integrate FBMT sessions into their social and technical coffee curriculum for farmers – the national standard on educating the future coffee farmer with the knowledge and skills to live a meaningful and purposeful life through coffee production, processing and marketing. To support this process, the project delivered a training of trainers FBMT package to 15 CIC extension staff from across six Highlands provinces.³²

In addition to ensuring industry-driven extension services address both the social and technical aspects of smallholder coffee production, the project has delivered two additional training packages to both government and private sector extension staff - Gender Equality and Diversity (GED) training and Facilitation Skills training. GED training focusses on building a basic understanding of gender and

³² CARE International in PNG. 2019. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report July-December 2019*. Internal document.

the ways in which it affects individuals, families and communities and what gender equality means for extension officers in the context of working with coffee farming families. Facilitation skills training focusses on skills and techniques to run effective and participatory training to enhance learning for participants from low-literacy backgrounds. The gender-inclusive focus of the training also includes specific strategies to engage women farmers and ensure their active participation.

The combination of GED and facilitation training, has led to improvement in the inclusiveness of extension services delivered by partners. For example, most of the male extension officers and community-based coordinators reported that prior to the training, they would only speak to men farmers.³³ Since the training however, extension officers at both SMS and PNGCE have made changes to the format of their technical trainings – modules are now participatory with practical demonstrations and activities and written material is accompanied by pictures. Extension officers also report that they have changed their facilitation styles to include women and men. An extension officer from SMS stated *'we are now more conscious that men will always take the front seat and put women in the back seat...this is custom...so now we arrange the seating so women can also easily observe and participate'*. Extension officers at PNGCE also report they are now more aware that, *'it's not only about the women raising her voice up but also about ensuring men make the space for her to do that'*. Both SMS and PNGCE extension officers report specifically asking women if they have questions or ideas at the end of each training module they deliver. Extension officers have also reported that the higher level of technical, gender, and family business management knowledge gained through working with the project has increased their level of professionalism. Increased professionalism was reported to include improvements in work ethics and practices, clearer appreciation of roles and responsibilities, and more effective planning and review. Extension officers and graduates reported that farmers are more open and responsive to them and respect them more as professionals and experts since they have been working with the project.³⁴

At the time of P1 of the evaluation, CISP had delivered GED and facilitation training to approximately 80 per cent of its three private sector partners and CICs extension staff.

The project baseline from 2013-2014 found that less than five per cent of farmers receiving extension training were women. CISP has significantly increased women farmers access to extension services and agricultural training both through the model farming family approach (IO1.4) and through partner industry driven extension services.

IO3.2 Coffee exporters increasingly invest in gender equality through their programs and policies

Section IO3.1 demonstrates how private sector partners have integrated gender inclusive approaches into their extension services and developed extension service protocols for engaging and supporting women farmers. CISP has also been effective in influencing private sector partners to invest in gender equality at an organisational-level through their programs and policies.

For example, CARE in partnership with the industry partners designed and implemented a coffee industry graduate program in order to address the critical gap in women extension officers. The program places high-achieving agricultural studies graduates with industry partners as part of a 12-month graduate program where they gain extension skills and experience. Partners are required to nominate a number of places for female graduates to encourage improved gender equity in extension services. The program is an important connection between the private sector and universities and presents a unique opportunity for female graduates to gain experience as extension officers, and for

³³ CARE International in PNG. *Coffee Industry Support Project: Change Story*, Thomas Oruga, Coordinator Backyard Farms

³⁴ Pacific Women. 2017. *CARE International in PNG Coffee Industry Support Project Mid-term Evaluation Report*. CARE International in PNG.

the private sector recognise the benefits of having women-led extension. The program is a low-risk way for partners to pilot recruiting women extension officers, and is the most direct route to eventually increase the numbers of women extension officers on staff.

At the beginning of the graduate program (2015), there were no female extension officers working with private sector exporters. Whilst CISP facilitated the first round of the graduate program in 2015, today industry partners such as SMS-PNG have demonstrated their commitment to actively recruiting new female graduates as standard practice. SMS-PNG employed its first two graduates (one woman and one man) as permanent extension officers' and recruited a third, female graduate completed her 12-month program. PNGCE extended the contracts of its first two female graduates for a second year and seconded them to an associated cooperative, AAK where they provided extension support and gained further experience through project-supported governance activities. Both have now left to pursue other work opportunities. Partners report that the graduate program provides an opportunity not only to support young professionals to gain valuable work experience, but also to actively recruit young women into a male-dominated industry. As the Director of SMS noted, *'it is more than a strategic choice to have female extension officers on our staff – it is simple common sense. The feedback and active engagement of farmers with our entire team during field visits is fantastic. I think this is due to the fact we have women in our team that maintain this rapport with PNGs female coffee growers'*. Young women graduates report that despite the challenges of working in a male-dominated industry, their presence has resulted in women farmers being more likely to participate and share their experiences with extension services. As one female graduate noted, *'It's like I am working on behalf of the women and I represent them. They come to me and we talk openly. I see that most of the time in society we give males a higher status and keep women behind – but that holds back families and their success as farmers. So, I think what CARE and SMS are doing with female extension officers is important – having women in extension will create change'*.

The engagement of female graduates has increased the number of women farmers approaching extension officers for information. For example, during their 12-month graduate program period, the SMS PNG graduates provided training to nearly 1200 women.³⁵

The project also conducted organisational gender assessments (OAP) and developed gender action plans (GAPs) with SMS-PNG; PNGCE and CIC during the first phase of the project. This process was aimed at building an understanding of the benefits of gender equity and diversity in the workplace. Some private sector partners have gone on to action recommendations from OAPs and GAPs within their financial management and human resources systems. For example, SMS has made policy changes to their extension officers' salary scales to ensure all officers regardless of gender receive the same pay and benefits. These changes mark important organisational level changes within the industry.

IO3.3 The CIC increasingly aligns policy and strategy with GESI and MTDP3

The relationship with CIC has progressed considerably over the last 18 months presenting an opportunity for the replicability, scale and sustainability of project models. CIC recently launched its Strategic Business Plan 2020-2024 – the plan aims to 'transform the industry from subsistence level to a well-coordinated and sustainable sector that is economically profitable for all and restores PNG as a key player in the world coffee market'. This vision is underpinned by six key objectives - objectives four and five focus on the provision of appropriate extension services and the strengthened

³⁵ Pacific Women. 2017. *CARE International in PNG Coffee Industry Support Project Mid-term Evaluation Report*.

governance and capacity of coffee cooperatives and farmers groups.³⁶ CIC has recognised the potential of project models such as FMBT and VSLA+ to support it in achieving these objectives. CIC has expressed its intention to integrate both VSLA+ and FMBT as central strategies under objectives four and five of its Strategic Business Plan.³⁷

To support this process the project conducted foundational GED and facilitation training for CIC extension staff, followed by training of trainers (TOT) sessions on FLT, VSLA+ and FMBT.³⁸ A total of 54 CIC extension staff received training and support in these areas (37% women; 63% men).

Following these intensive training sessions, CIC established five VSLA groups (four with Neknasi Coffee Cooperative, Boana District, Morobe Province and one with Yameuho Sun Rise Cooperative, Asaro District, Eastern Highlands Province). CIC is aiming to establish a total of 30 savings groups across all coffee growing provinces.³⁹ CIC extension teams (together with project support) have also delivered FMBT to CIC farmer cooperatives in Okapa District, Eastern Highlands Province. Based on capacity assessments of these sessions, CARE is confident that CIC extension teams are capable of delivering a high standard of savings group training with minimal supervision going forward.⁴⁰

As noted under IO3.1, CIC's intention is to integrate FMBT sessions into their social and technical coffee curriculum for farmers – the national standard on educating the future coffee farmer with the knowledge and skills to live a meaningful and purposeful life through coffee production, processing and marketing. This has significant potential impact for coffee farming families with the next generation likely to increase the demand/expectation for accessible and inclusive extension services.

IO3.4 Coffee cooperatives are stronger and better able to support women members

Project support to the three-partner coffee cooperatives remains in the early stages due to the COVID-19 pandemic and the consequent delays in implementation. Organisational Strengthening Training (OST) was delivered to government, industry and cooperative members in late 2019 (M:70%; F:30%).⁴¹ The intention was that CIC and industry partners (with project support) will deliver OST to their farmer groups and cooperatives during 2020, however this is now likely to occur in 2021. The capacity of cooperatives for inclusive governance and the ability of women members to participate and influence those decision-making process and structures that affect their coffee livelihoods, will be explored during P2 of the evaluation (see section 3.3 for further detail).

CHALLENGES

Private sector scepticism of the business case for inclusive supply chains remains: private sector partners are ultimately interested in their bottom-line, profitability, and are motivated to address any inequalities in the supply chain that hinder the quality and quantity of coffee production. P1 of the evaluation found that whilst private sector partners view women as integral to the supply chain, many do not consider their contributions valuable enough to make long-term investments. Private sector partners remain reluctant to make gender equality a priority because of a perceived lack of empirical evidence that gender-sensitive approaches and gender equity are linked to improved profitability,

³⁶ Coffee Industry Corporation. 2020. *Strategic Business Plan 2020-2024*.

³⁷ Key Informant Interview with CIC representative.

³⁸ CARE International in PNG. 2019. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report July-December 2019*. Internal document.

³⁹ CARE International in PNG. 2020. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report January-June 2020*. Internal document.

⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴¹ CARE International in PNG. 2019. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report July-December 2019*. Internal document.

supply chain efficiency and sustainability. To address this, CARE conducted research with the aim of developing a business case for promoting gender equity and inclusive approaches within the supply chain. The business case research presents empirical evidence, mainly in relation to productivity including evidence that coffee production is greater in households where women have been able to access and benefit from extension services – in other words those households where women are empowered are also more productive households. Unfortunately, there are also a number of gaps within the research. For example, the research could have been strengthened by collecting and analyzing evidence on the connections between empowered households and coffee quality and between empowered households and their motivation to reinvest income into their coffee farms and enterprises. This type of supporting evidence would have been attractive to industry partners and possibly made for a more convincing business case.

At the time of the evaluation, the business case research and its findings were yet to be shared beyond CARE itself.

Recruitment and retention of female extension officers: the graduate program provides an important pathway for agricultural female graduates to gain coffee extension experience and the project has made significant gains in this area with the number of female extension officers increasing from a baseline of zero to 5% within private sector partners. However, rather than increasing over time, the number of female graduates entering extension services has remained steady since the program began in 2015. Women graduates report that they face a number of challenges performing effectively in a male-dominated industry and cash-crop. Patriarchal attitudes are widespread and can be resistant to change - culturally, men are perceived to be more knowledgeable than women and therefore male farmers are reluctant to listen to female extension officers and will dismiss or discount the value of information given to them by women. This can make the task of communicating extension information to farmers difficult for female extension officers. This male-dominated culture also permeates the workplace, which can marginalise women and make it much difficult for them to perform their extension roles. Women graduate/extension officers report challenges in seeking guidance and assistance from male colleagues, in asserting their authority with male colleagues, and in applying for promotions and advancing their career. Finally, women graduate/extension officers note that personal safety in the communities where they work can also be a challenge.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Build on the business case research and communicate the findings: there remains a continued need to document and promote the business case for meaningfully investing in gender equity within the coffee supply chain and communicating it to businesses, buyers, and producer organisations. Convincing industry partners that they can be more profitable by being more inclusive is key to the sustainability of not only program outcomes and models but also the socio-economic well-being of coffee farming families. Private sector partners in PNG are increasingly aware of the fragile nature of the supply chain, especially in smallholder coffee farming communities, and therefore there is an opportunity to build on and expand the business case position from one focussed on increased productivity and quality to one of increased profitability and resilience of supply. The business case should bring together findings from different research pieces undertaken to date, particularly the Family Teams Approach research and Business Case research. Business case advocacy messaging should highlight both the critical role of women farmers in successful supply chains, and their potential to transform the industry in terms of quality and quantity of coffee production – but also how addressing socio-cultural constraints to ensure gender equality in the coffee supply chain is actually central to guaranteeing future resilience of supply and ensuring future generations find farming attractive.

The project should consider investing in developing advocacy materials (e.g., short advocacy briefs) and convening forums to influence and communicate the business case.

Incentivise private sector senior management to formalise support to women graduates/extension officers: the challenges faced by women graduates/extension officers highlights the need to assess the readiness of partners to support women in the workplace before placements are made within the organisation. OGAs and GAPs conducted during phase one of the project, should be updated with a specific focus on putting in place systems or mechanisms to support the continued recruitment and retention of women graduates/extension officers. Private sector partners need to formally invest in mentoring support for female graduates and revisit risk management strategies to ensure the safety of women extension officers in the field.

UNANTICIPATED OUTCOMES

COVID-19: Protecting those at the heart of the program

The COVID-19 pandemic is an incredibly serious health challenge that puts the most vulnerable people at risk – a group that includes the coffee farming families participating under the project. The project has shown considerable flexibility and responsiveness to the COVID-19 crisis, moving quickly to meet immediate needs with targeted short-term responses, while also planning for the potential longer-term impact.

Generating evidence to inform localised response efforts

During April 2020, the project participated in a regional Rapid Gender Analysis (RGA) to better understand the differential and gendered impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic within communities and is in the process of adapting and targeting project activities and strategies based on the findings.

Keeping communities informed and protected

Awareness of hygiene and preventative measures is crucial and the project has pivoted and reprioritized capacity-building and training initiatives to focus on public health messaging on preventing, detecting and responding to the virus. For example, COVID-19 awareness information campaigns were delivered to government extension teams, private sector extension teams, savings groups and cooperatives. The information campaign provided risk communication on symptoms, transmission, and public health messaging on crucial hygiene practices to slow the spread such as social distancing, handwashing, safe ways to sneezes and cough. A total of 151 people (59% women; 41% men) were reached through the COVID-19 awareness information campaigns.⁴²

⁴² CARE International in PNG. 2020. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report January-June 2020*. Internal document.

3.3 Governance

PROGRESS AND CHALLENGES

CISP works to strengthen inclusive governance of coffee cooperatives ensuring equitable opportunities for participation and influence and economies of scale for women farmers. The main strategy for achieving this is through Organisational Strengthening Training (OST). OST has four modules including: 1) Kamapim OI Priorities, 2) Kamapim Faiv Yia Plen, 3) Wok Mak bilong Lida, Meneja na Membas and 4) Monitoring & Evaluation. OST provides the basis of capacity-strengthening and support to three project cooperative partners: Apo Angra Angana Kange (AAAK), Neknasi and Lower Unggai Community Development (LUCDF). OST training of trainers was delivered to cooperatives in late 2019 and these partners were scheduled to roll out the training with cooperatives during 2020. However, this has been delayed until early 2021 due to the COVID-19 pandemic and restrictions.⁴³

P1 of the evaluation found that there is evidence that savings groups are proving to be a safe space where democratic governance can be nurtured and supported, with the majority of savings groups demonstrating a strong commitment to the governance and accountability features of the VSLA model such as the constitution. COVID19 has meant that the intensive support and mentoring that would normally be provided to newly established savings groups has not been possible with the result that governance of those groups has been weaker than hoped. By contrast, there is evidence that within cooperatives, inclusive governance has been more challenging with internal politics ending some partnerships.⁴⁴

Beyond this however, P1 of the evaluation found that governance is a relatively undocumented area for the project, and therefore this will be a focus for P2 of the evaluation.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Introduce a Participatory Governance Assessment Tool: Given that OST remains in the early stages of delivery, there is an opportunity to revise the approach to ensure 1) a practical focus on improving the internal governance of cooperatives and 2) evidence on improvements in cooperative inclusive governance are captured by P2 of the evaluation. One mechanism to support this would be the introduction of a 'Participatory Governance Assessment Tool' (PGAT). The PGAT is used to assess inclusive governance practices within community-based structures such as a cooperative. Cooperative group members evaluate the extent to which the decision making and management practices within the group comply with the four 'pillars' of good governance: transparency, participation, accountability and predictability. The assessment is guided by a set of sixteen governance indicators which participants rate as very good, good, moderate or poor. Responses are recorded on a matrix and later presented visually as a spider-web diagram. Finally, a Governance Improvement Plan is formulated. The executive committee monitors the implementation of the improvement plan and ensures that members are regularly consulted in assessing its progress. This tool has proved very useful to promote the inclusive governance of cooperatives by identifying their strengths and areas to be improved.⁴⁵ As this tool presents a group's status visually, it is also simple for low-literacy members to understand their present status and determine the expected status in

⁴³ CARE International in PNG. 2020. *Coffee Industry Support Project Six-monthly Progress Report January-June 2020*. Internal document.

⁴⁴ Governance and political issues within cooperatives resulted in slow progress with a number of cooperative partnerships. Partnerships with Sukapass and Timuza cooperatives were ended or suspended during Phase 2 of the project.

⁴⁵ CARE International in Nepal. 2012. *Hariyo Ban Program. Internal Governance Tool 3*. Available at: https://www.wfnepal.org/hariyobanprogram/hariyo_ban_program_publications/?209502/Internal-Governance-Tool-3-Participatory-Governance-Assessment

future. The use of this tool can help to improve the overall functioning of a group and its ability to manage decision-making, opportunities and resources in an equitable and sustainable manner. In addition, it provides a useful basis for monitoring and evaluation processes. The PGAT would require contextualisation for use by coffee cooperatives in the Highlands, but represents a single, simple and effective process to both strengthen and measure improvements in the inclusive governance of cooperatives. The PGAT should be introduced as a pilot community-based social accountability tool with two cooperatives (AAAK and Neknasi) with the learnings documented.

Continue to progress cooperative gender action plans: the project plans to deliver Gender Equity and Diversity (GED) training to cooperative and cluster leadership teams, which in turn will provide the foundation for Organisational Gender Assessments (OGA) and the development of Gender Action Plans (GAP). The GAPs will identify priority actions that the cooperative wants to take to become more gender inclusive and what steps are necessary to achieve the action. CISP will provide ongoing support and mentoring with the development and completion of GAPs. These were scheduled to take place in 2020, however the COVID-19 pandemic has delayed these activities and these are scheduled to recommence 2021.

3.4 Sustainability

PROGRESS

With 18 months of project implementation remaining, under P1 of the evaluation it is not yet possible to assess the extent to which the outcomes of project strategies and models will be maintained after formal support has ended. Therefore, sustainability is one of the areas to be explored further during P2 of the evaluation.

Nevertheless, emerging indicators of sustainability from P1 of the evaluation are:

Partnerships for gender-equitable agribusiness: core to the sustainability of the project is its partnerships structure, mainly with the private sector, which has the resources, capacity and motivation to scale-up and replicate the project strategies and models. The project has leveraged non-financial resources of private sector partners, mainly exporter and cooperative extension services. P1 of the evaluation found that all project partners believed their own mandates and/or business strategies were aligned with project-promoted strategies and are willing to continue these activities beyond the project. Private sector partners have adopted gender equitable practices/content within their extension services and training whilst CIC is in the process of integrating models such as FBM and VSLA as part of its national coffee curriculum and strategic business plan. However, whilst the different partnership models are complementary (private sector, community-based organisations, government), their capacity and outreach are markedly different. Private sector partners have a higher degree of capacity and potential to continue / scale up the project activities, compared to CIC which has limited human and financial resources.

Working with model farming families: the sustainability of the outcomes under CISP are closely related to the real and tangible benefits experienced by men and women farmers. The more tangible and visible the benefits received, the stronger the potential for sustainability will be. P1 found tangible benefits gained by farming families, especially in the areas of skills and knowledge on agricultural practices, coffee production and quality, and household income. Therefore, the evaluation considers that sustainability of technical skills is likely to be high. Women and men farmers are likely to continue applying recently gained skills and agricultural practices in their coffee gardens, having seen the benefits of implementing such techniques both in terms of production, quality, price and therefore household income. As VSLAs reach the end of their first savings cycle, they become increasingly capable of managing themselves independently as evidenced by the fact that 10 of the 15 savings groups established under the project are entering into their second or third cycle. There have been gradual positive changes in women's relationships with their husband around a more equal distribution of labour in the home and shared decision-making on household income and expenditure. However, that such changes risk being temporary in the absence of further gender sensitisation, and socio-cultural norms risk reverting any gains made.

Continuous program learning and improvement: P1 of the evaluation found that program models developed, piloted and promoted within CISP have added value to other development initiatives. For example, CARE PNG's Bougainville Cocoa Family Support project (BECOMES) implemented between 2016-2020 drew on learnings and CISP processes to strengthen women's economic empowerment and drive renewal of the cocoa industry. BECOMES successfully adopted the model farming family approach to develop extension and business services. CARE Vanuatu's Leftemap Sista program which aims to promote women and girl's leadership, skills development and economic empowerment, has successfully adapted and applied the Family Business Management Training model to its integrated interventions.

CHALLENGES

Cooperative governance: smallholder cooperatives and community-based organisations face challenges in sustaining the gains achieved through their partnership with CISP. Currently the three partner cooperatives, LUCDF, AAK and Nekansi are not sufficiently robust to function effectively without ongoing support. Cooperatives require further intensive support to turn good governance principles into practice, and to access processing and marketing stages of the supply chain.

COVID-19: it should be noted that the coffee industry in PNG has structural constraints that go beyond the scope of CISP, making it a livelihood vulnerable to external shocks. Recently, the COVID-19 pandemic has compounded the downward trend in coffee bean prices as the rise in home consumption is unlikely to offset decreased demand and sales at retail coffee shops, restaurants and hotels that have been closed as a result of global lockdowns and social distancing. At the time of writing this report (December 2020), the COVID-19 caseload remains low for the Highlands and Papua New Guinea overall, but the potential remains for disruption within the coffee supply chain. It remains to be seen what impact this may have on private sector partners engagement as they switch to operationalising sanitary and social distancing protocols for the whole chain of production, and on coffee farming families and their ability to prioritise coffee smallholding as a viable livelihood in a volatile market.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Develop a clear exit strategy that leaves behind post-project structures and processes for sustainability, expansion of services, and ongoing support: with eighteen months remaining, it is timely for CISP to develop a clear exit strategy in consultation with partners. Fostering sustainability should be core to the strategy and the project's partnership approach lends itself to three time-sensitive steps in exiting:

- 1) phasing down (a gradual reduction of program activities, whilst ensuring community ownership and motivation to sustain program benefits while project starts deploys fewer resources. This would be particularly relevant to models such as savings groups and model farming family extension);
- 2) phasing over (transferring program activities to government and private sector partners. This will depend on previous capacity building and implementing some recommendations such as the business case to ensure services such as FBM/OST can or will be continued through local structures); and
- 3) phasing out (withdrawal of program activities without turning it over to another institution for continued implementation. This may be the case for the financial literacy training, facilitation training and GED training and this must be communicated sensitively and effectively to partners and communities ahead of time).

See the earlier section 3.3 on governance for recommendations on strengthening cooperative inclusive governance.

3.5 Impact

PROGRESS

P1 of the evaluation demonstrates that CISP has made considerable progress towards its overall goal of improving socio-economic wellbeing of women coffee farmers in the Highlands of PNG. Activity monitoring and reporting combined with project reviews, provided a sound basis for assessing effectiveness during P1 of the evaluation. It is more difficult, however, to ascertain the impact of the program to date based on a meta-analysis of existing program documentation alone. Therefore, impact is one of the areas to be explored further during P2 of the evaluation.

Nevertheless, emerging areas of potential impact from P1 of the evaluation are:

Private-sector mindset shift towards understanding women are central to a resilient and secure coffee supply chain: CISP has led to a mindset shift amongst private sector partners which increasingly recognises the best way to ensure sustainability is to see coffee producers and their communities as vital stakeholders in their long-term success by putting farmers and communities at the heart of their supply chain.

Resilient farming families: sustainability and household resilience in coffee farming communities does not depend on coffee alone - in reality, coffee smallholders in the Highlands accept a high degree of risk and uncertainty - the threat of disease and significant rain or changing temperatures means coffee yields may vary substantially from year to year combined with global price volatility. Over-reliance might create unsustainable conditions. CISP recognises this and supports coffee farming families to grow income opportunities within local economies (and this work will continue over the next eighteen months through savings groups, the market analysis and support for local women entrepreneurs to start new business activities).

Evidence-based advocacy and influencing: CISP has successfully generated and presented substantial and substantive evidence for persuasive advocacy and influence purposes with the coffee supply chain. CISP has gathered, analysed, and presented data and evidence that supply chains are more resilient when women farmers can reach their full potential. These ambitious research pieces have made a significant contribution to the discussion on how the private sector can reshape women's roles in the coffee supply chain and have the potential to significantly influence the sector over the coming eighteen months.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Rather than standalone recommendations, maximising impact by project-end will depend on whether the recommendations made previously under relevance, effectiveness, governance and sustainability are reviewed, agreed on and implemented over the remaining eighteen months.

PHASE 2 APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY

The evaluation will take a participatory approach to the design and analysis of P2. CISP program staff will play a central role in both shaping and contributing to the design and analysis of the end-of-project evaluation.

Conducting an evaluation in the during a global pandemic calls for special attention to ethics and trauma-informed approaches. The evaluation will adapt data collection approaches and methods and the presentation of findings to ensure that risks are carefully assessed and mitigated under P2.

Step 1: Participatory process to prioritize themes and outputs (October 2021)

Step 1 will review and consolidate evidence from P1 and recent monitoring and reporting, to understand what gaps remain, so as to identify the priorities for themes and questions that will drive the design of Phase 2. Much effectiveness evidence data has already been documented; and therefore, P2 will provide an opportunity to focus on impact, sustainability, promising practices and to explore areas (such as governance) that will provide key learning for partners for future programming.

Starting in October 2021, the evaluation consultant will work closely together with the CISP program team, to discuss possible themes and approaches, and honing in on budget and viability of methods, keeping in mind the realities on the ground, timeline, and budget.

Step 2: Methods Design (November 2021)

Based on inputs from Step 1, the evaluation consultant will submit an updated evaluation plan, to include sampling methods, data collection tools and analysis processes. This Phase 2 plan will be submitted to the CISP program team during November 2021.

Based on feedback, the evaluation consultant will finalize the details and logistics of the Phase 2 plan.

Step 3: Data Collection (November 2021)

Following agreement on the Phase 2 evaluation methods the team will commence the data collection which is expected to involve:

1. Quantitative coffee smallholder/farming family survey
2. Qualitative key informant interviews, focus groups discussions and stories of change
3. Data entered into a simple excel spreadsheet according to agreed coding
4. Interviews transcribed, translated, stored centrally in secure site

Phase 4: Analysis and reporting (December 2021)

Following data collection, the evaluation consultant will systematically analyse the data. Analysis is expected to involve the following:

1. Thematic analysis against proposed framework
2. Draft outcomes collated
3. Developing outputs and deliverables.

Step 5: Finalization (December 2021)

The evaluation consultant will submit a draft evaluation report to CARE for review and feedback before submitting a final report.